Attitudes toward refugees and inclusive European citizenship. Analysis for an intercultural educational proposal with teachers in training

Actitudes hacia personas refugiadas y ciudadanía europea inclusiva. Análisis para una propuesta educativa intercultural con el profesorado en formación

Cala, Verónica C.; Soriano-Ayala, Encarnación & López-Martínez Manuel J.
University of Almeria (Spain).

Abstract

The recent migratory crisis has multiplied the number of school age people that are forced to immigrate. The integration of the minors in host countries demands not only schooling, but also an inclination of the educational community to accept the said reality and critically manage European immigration policies. At the European level there is a growing rejection toward the migratory phenomenon and European policies. This study analyzes the attitudes toward refugees through the perception of real threat, symbol, and the affective reactions that the future professors experience. Furthermore, it explores in what extent the attitudes toward refugees are related to an inclusive European citizenship. It involves survey research (a sample of 624 education students from southeast Spain in recent years) with a transversal design. The used instrument is a modified version of the scale of attitudes and a scale of inclusive European citizenship itself. The results show a marked indifference toward the related issues with refugees, but not a perceived elevated threat or marked emotional reactions. While the attitudes toward refugees are not very positive, there is a positive inclusive European citizenship that legitimizes the reception of refugees in European states, the cession of equal rights and possibilities of new forms of coexistence. This study manifests a marked correlation between attitudes toward refugees and inclusive European citizenship, where the perceived threat appears like the principal predictor of inclusive citizenship. The results permit us to place these future teachers inside the European panorama as one of the social sectors less affected by the growing xenophobia and discredit toward the European Union. However, they are precise and urgent programs of training in intercultural, antiracist and migratory education

Keywords: Attitudes towards refugees; intercultural; faculty; European intercultural citizenship

Resumen

La reciente crisis migratoria ha multiplicado el número de personas en edad escolar que migran forzosamente. La integración de los menores en los países de acogida exige no solo su escolarización sino una inclinación de la comunidad educativa para aceptar dicha realidad y gestionar críticamente las políticas europeas migratorias. A nivel europeo hay un creciente rechazo hacia el fenómeno migratorio y hacia las políticas europeas. El estudio analiza las actitudes hacia los refugiados mediante la percepción de amenaza real y simbólica y las reacciones afectivas que los futuros profesores experimentan. Además, explora en qué medida las actitudes hacia los refugiados se relacionan con una ciudadanía europea inclusiva. Se trata de una investigación mediante encuesta (una muestra de 624 estudiantes de los últimos años de magisterio del sureste español) con un diseño transversal. El instrumento utilizado es una versión modificada de las escalas de actitudes de Amenaza realista y simbólica, Escala de actitudes prejuiciosas, y una Escala de Ciudadanía Europea Inclusiva de elaboración propia. Los resultados muestran una marcada

Corresponding author / Autor de contacto

Verónica C. Cala. University of Almeria. Edif. Central, despacho 2-11, 04120 - La Cañada de San Urbano, Almería (España). e-mail: vcc284@ual.es

indiferencia hacia las cuestiones relacionadas con las personas refugiadas, no existiendo una amenaza percibida elevada ni reacciones emocionales marcadas. Si bien las actitudes hacia refugiados manifiestan desinterés, sí existe una ciudadanía europea inclusiva positiva que legitima la acogida de refugiados de los estados europeos, la cesión de iguales derechos y posibilidades de nuevas formas de convivencia. El estudio manifiesta una marcada correlación entre las actitudes hacia los refugiados y la ciudadanía europea inclusiva, donde una menor amenaza percibida aparece como principal predictor de una mayor ciudadanía inclusiva. Los resultados nos permiten situar a estos futuros docentes dentro del panorama europeo como uno de los sectores sociales menos afectados por la creciente xenofobia y descrédito hacia la Unión Europea. No obstante, son precisos y urgentes programas de formación en educación intercultural, antirracista y de atención a los refugiados.

Palabras clave: Actitudes hacia refugiados; profesorado; ciudadanía europea intercultural

In 2017, the number of forced displaced persons increase to 68.5 million people, of which 52% were under 18 years old. In the last ten years the number of people who immigrate against their will has increase to more than 50%. So that currently, 1 out of every 110 people in the world is displaced and one out of every 220 is a minor (ACNUR, 2018). In many cases displacement is produced in conditions of extreme danger. The International Organization for Migration estimate that in 2017, close to 186 million people immigrated to Europe across the Mediterranean. (OIM, 2017). These numbers suppose that this is the most important humanitarian crisis after World War II.

International organizations consider it a priority to attend to this international migratory issue from the socio-educational sphere, welcoming minors and adults in education systems to favor their subsistence and integration in host countries (ACNUR, 2018; 2016; Wrench *et al.* 2018). However, educational attention requires an adaptation of their own systems considering the specific problems associated with children and young refugees, such as the difficulties in accessing education, the incomprehension of the immigration process by the faculty, classmates that sometimes are not conscious of the trauma refugee children have caused by the conflict, the lack of a sense of belonging, language barriers, segregation and discrimination in school environments (Dryden-Peterson, 2011, 2016). Faced with these problems, it is necessary to develop new

educational strategies that respond to global migration phenomena (Banks, Suárez-Orozco, & Ben-Peretz, 2016), knowing that the development of inclusive and intercultural educational policies and programs, allows us to improve attitudes toward migrants and refugees and a decrease in school xenophobia (Sharkey, 2018). Attitudes towards refugees appear as a central issue in the development of intercultural education policies. Tomkinson (2018) shows how beliefs and attitudes towards refugees play an important role in the management of migration.

The role of the faculty appears as one of the key parts of the process of reception and integration of refugees. The research done in the United States reflects how, despite its long history of receiving refugees, the faculty continues to not be prepared for it, showing little understanding of the situation, negative attitudes toward refugees and little intercultural sensitivity or competence (Li, 2018; McWilliams, 2015). The study by Tarman & Gürel (2017) completed in Turkey with future teachers shows a growing disinterest for the migratory issue and produces worse attitudes among those that find themselves in contexts with a high percentage of refugee populations. Additionally, a European study that involved various sites with universities shows that the image towards refugees that arrive to the European Union is situated in negative stereotypes and in discourse characterized by fear of those refugees. They also warn of the lack of knowledge and the disinformation

prevailing among students in these areas. (Padilla & Goldberg, 2017).

Attitudes towards refugees

The creation of attitudes is not merely an individual matter since it depends on a complex combination of personal circumstances, values and on one´s surroundings (political discourse, migratory and social politics, media and civil society). The attitudes are relatively stable so as to be measurable, but they are also sensitive to changes, being able to perceive differences even with regions of the same country (Drinkwater, Drinkwater, & Kauser, 2013). They can be defined as the relatively long-lasting set of beliefs, feelings, and behavioral tendencies towards objects, groups, events or socially significant symbols (Hogg, 2006), in this case towards refugees, that is, those people that bring about a mandatory migration motivated by causes out of their control.

The analysis of attitudes towards refugees in a differentiated way to migrants is based on the identification of different behaviors between the two, for which the former, towards refugees, are more influenced by political-ideological factors, the existence of xenophobic discourse and hate, and the second by economic factors (Getmansky & Zeitzoff, 2018; Steele & Abdelaaty, 2018). Attitudes towards refugees are determined by political concerns related to ethnic identity, social cohesion and national security. While, as other studies have shown, economic concerns related to income and occupation have a greater influence on attitudes towards immigrants (Semyonov, Raijman, & Gorodzeisky, 2008).

Psychological theories about attitudes

From social psychology different theories have been defined that explain the creation of attitudes between human groups. Among them, *the theory of social identity* of Tajfel and Turner (1979) stands out, which analyzes how the sense of belonging to a social group motivates the specific behavior towards their own group, and another different behavior towards what they understand as different groups. Strong national identities (defenders of national security, culture and traditional values) are related to greater distance from, perception of threat and rejection towards migrants and refugees than hybrid, cosmopolitan or intercultural identities (Dixon et al., 2018). The *contact theory* of Allport and Pettigrew (Allport, 1954; Pettigrew, 1979, 1998) argues that there are more prejudices and distance between groups when there is little interaction between them. And the *social dominance theory* of Sidanius and Pratto (1999) explains how social relations are organized based on pre-existing structures such as racism, sexism or nationalism, and how according to these systems of stratification attitudes, values and beliefs are formed between the groups. The studies that delve into the groups that request asylum show that there are different degrees of threat according to their origin, their racialization and their gender, the rejection towards Muslims groups and those that come from Africa being more intense (Yitmen and Ve, 2017).

Finally, that which this study is based on, is *the integrated threat model* that posits that a group develops hostile attitudes when its members perceive their collective status to be endangered, worsening attitudes and behaviors towards the outside group (Stephan and Stephan, 1985; Stephan and Renfro, 2002). In such a way that, the great the perceived threat and the greater the belief that material resources (employment, social services) or symbolic ones (culture, beliefs) of the group itself are endangered, independent of if it´s due to a real or perceived threat, worsening attitudes are created towards the others. The relationship between the in-group and the outgroup is established by configuring a "we" and a "they", usually in dichotomous terms. The national identity is one of the most solid attributes of conformation of similarities and feeling of belonging within a community, endogroup, reason why this theory has been widely used to analyze the relationships between natives and people who immigrate voluntarily or forcibly. In the integrated theory of threat, the perception of threat operates independently of whether the threat is real or only felt. The degree of perceived threat has been related to various factors such as the size and social conditioners of the outgroup and the endogroup, the existence of a multiculturalist ideology or the development

of integration policies (Stark, Mäs & Flache, 2015).

Attitudes and an inclusive European citizenry

The migratory red tape on the part of European institutions and the warm welcoming and the integration of refugees converge on the notion of a democratic and inclusive European citizenry (Gualda, 2011). The concept of an inclusive European citizenry (De Lucas, 2001) includes an expansion of the term of citizenry beyond the limits of nationalities of the member states. Let us remembers that the citizenry has been tied to the idea of a nation-state. This expansion in the concept of citizenry presumes that migratory flows demand the knowledge of universal rights to free movement and the expansion of the legal statute of citizen to all migrant people. This implies at the same time the knowledge of identities of the persons and people that arrive to Europe, in the respect of cultural differences and, fundamentally, in the expansion of freedoms, social and political rights to immigrant persons.

As the theory of social identity maintains, views towards immigrants and refugees are related to the notion of citizenry that is formed. According to the identity formation that exists, whether or not it integrates in its definition the other: refugee and migrant, this will change the predisposition towards policies of welcoming and intercultural models. For this reason, the principal objective of this study is to identify the attitudes of future teachers towards refugees and the attitudes of Europeans as a whole.

Method

Participants

The participants were university students studying their masters in Infant and Primary School education. These degrees were selected since they include people who, in the near future, potentially, will teach and be models of young boys and girls, and they will have an impact on the perception of society and the coexistence to be established within

it. Of these, 150 (23.8%) are men and 479 (76.2%) women. The average age was 21.78 years old (22.36 on average for men and 21.55 for women), with ages ranging from 18 to 55 years old.

Instruments

Along with personal information, information on three scales was collected, two selected from other studies complete with refugees and immigrants, and a third, independently developed, focused on the arrival, recognition, and welcoming of refugees, especially those from Syria, in the European Union.

The first scale we´ve denoted as Threats and Rights and it is based on the Realistic and Symbolic Threat Scale created by Sthepham, Ibarra, and Bachman (1999). In our case we have utilized 9 of the 12 principles that conform to it. The factorial analysis recognizes the selected items we classified in two factors, those which we have denoted a Threat Subscale, composed of six principles (ex: the reception of refugees is undermining Spanish culture), and the Rights Subscale that look at three principles (ex: refugees have the same right to help as the Spanish in situations of poverty). The response format is a Likert scale of five points, that range from 1 ¨totally disagree¨to 5 ¨totally agree. ¨ All the negative principles are codified in an inverse manner and then joined with the positives, in a way that high values on this scale determine less threat and more rights for the recently arrived. The total reliability of the scale has been 0.7555. The Threat Subscale casts $\alpha = 0.754$ and the Rights Subscale $\alpha = 0.64$.

The second scale we have designated is Affected Reactions. This scale is adapted from the Prejudicial Attitude Survey created by Stephan and Sthephan (1993) and the Emotions Scale denoted by Garcia et all (2003). The original scale consists of 12 terms, 6 emotions (ex: Hatred), and 6 adjectives (ex: Admiration). We have modified the scale and have added a conclusion so that there are 13 conclusions (Sympathy, Hatred, Admiration, Indifference, Confidence, Hostility, Rejection, Acceptance,

Affection, Superiority, Warmth, Disgust, and Shame). The responses were codified from 1 to 10, in which the students were asked to indicate the intensity produced by thinking of and seeing a refugee person (specifically, the refugees that arrive in Spain and the European Union fleeing wars), 1 feeling nothing and 10 feeling a lot. All of the words of negative value (ex: Hatred) are codified in an inverse manner and then joined with the words of positive value (ex: Sympathy) in a way that the highest values reflect less prejudicial feelings, thus, implying more acceptation and a larger positive affect. For our study we have utilized the specifications of the total scale and from the exclusive scale of positive reactions. The total scale has a reliability of 0.727 and the scale of positive reactions casts a α=0.889.

Lastly, an inclusive European Citizenry scale centered in the perception of the performance of the European Union and in the civic beliefs surrounding the arrival of refugees. This scale has been formed by eleven items, 3 with positive principles (ex: the arrival of refugee persons to the European Union is an opportunity to educate on peaceful coexistence) and 8 negative principles (ex: the refugee crisis could break the European Union). The response format is a Likert scale of 5 points that range from 1 meaning ¨totally disagree¨ to 5 points

meaning ¨totally agree.¨ Like in the other two scales, all the negative principles are codified in an inverse manner and then joined with the positively formulated principled, where the highest specializations show greater reception and a positive vision towards refugees that arrive in the European Union. For this scale the reliability is 0.703.

Procedure

The participants were invited to participate voluntarily, and were informed that the study would explore the attitudes towards refugee persons with guaranteed anonymity. Once informed consent was given, the participated proceeded to complete the questionnaire. The investigators assigned the questionnaires in classrooms with the professor of the course present. The investigators were at the disposal of the students to resolve any doubts that could appear in completing the questionnaire.

Results

Descriptive Statistics

The scales of Threats and Rights, the Affected Reactions, and the survey of inclusive European citizenship do not have quantitative cut-off points to decipher negative, neutral, and positive attitudes and prejudices. Thus descriptive statistics are calculated (Mean and Standard Deviation) for each one of the three scales.

Table 1. Scales descriptive Statistics and correlations among them

	Inclusive European Citizenship	Threats and Rights	Threats	Rights	Affected Reactions	Positively Affected Reactions
M	3.16	3.21	3.21	3.91	4.87	5.79
DS	.572	.777	.777	.837	1.005	1.9
α	.703	.755	.754	.64	.727	.889
Inclusive European Citizenship	1					
Threats and Rights	.513**	1				
Threats	.584**	.796**	1			
Rights	.267**	.828**	.320**	1		
Affected Reactions	.399**	.546**	.526**	.397**	1	
R Positively Affected Reactions	.483**	.567**	.553**	.374**	.924**	1

P = .000

The highest average score on a scale from 1 to 5 is found in the scale of rights (3.91). The rest of the scores are approximately 3 for the upper limit, which can be interpreted as a certain indifference or a minimal positive attitude of the participants toward refugees. On the other hand, for the scales from 1 to 10, the scales of Affected Reactions has an average below 5 and on the Positively Affected Reactions a score of 5.79 is reached, also showing a neutral attitude.

Correlations between the Scales and the Predictive Study

Positive correlations are observed in all of the scales. In the Inclusive European Citizenship scale, the highest correlation (.584) is found in the subscale of Threat, followed by the total scale of Threats and Rights (.513), and the subscale of Positively Affected Reactions (.483). The subscale of Positively Affected Reactions and the scale of Affected Reactions correlate with the subscale of Threats (.553 and .526 respectively).

In order to know how the criterion variable of Inclusive European Citizenship behaves, considering the obtained score in this questionnaire, in function with the independent variables or the "Subscales of Rights, Positivley Affected Reactions and Threats" predictors, a hierarchial regression is carried out.

Table 2. Summary of the hierarchical regression for inclusive European citizenship

	R^2_c	β	t	p
Model 1	.332			
Threats		.578	16.36	.000
Model 2	.367			
Threats		.444	10.553	.000
Positively Affected Reactions		.232	5.53	.000

Throughout the successive steps, two models are recognized. The system rejects a third model that introduces the score of the subscale of Rights as a predictor. It can be said that a regressor must contribute something substantive.

The first model explains 33.2%, the analysis of variance shows the variance explained by regression, where the value of F is 267.74 and whose associated probability is 0.000. This indicates a real effect of the Threats variable on the criterion variable "Inclusive European Citizenship" that also recognizes civic beliefs before the arrival of refugees.

The second model explains 36.7%. The value of F is 156.56 and the associated probability is 0.000, which shows a real effect of the variables of Threats and Positively Affected Reactions on the criterion variable.

The correlation that we have seen between the two predictors could suggest a problem of multicollinearity. The variance inflation factor (VIF) was less than 1.5 and the condition index less than 10, consequently multicollinearity is dismissed.

In both models, the prejudiced attitude of Perceived Threat is the one that has the greatest specific weight. In the second model the weight of the Positively Affected Reactions is half that of the Perceived Threat.

What explains these models is that, in our future teachers, the attitude of acceptance and support toward refugees, especially toward Syrian refugees that arrive to the European Union, depends on perceived threat. The positive reactions toward these unprotected people who seek refuge in the European Union have less weight.

Comparative Study of Above and Below the 50th Percentile in the Scale of Inclusive European Citizenship

The way in which the future teachers respond to the scales and specifically, to the scale of Inclusive European Citizenship with

the majority of scores around 3, whether by the upper or lower limit, has allowed us to understand how young people respond. The average of young people located in the 50th percentile is M=2.94 (SD=0.51) and average of those located above the 50th percentile is M=3.43 (SD=0.51). The attitude of both is approximately 3, meaning, there is a certain indifference, some with a slightly negative attitude and others slightly positive, although there are significant differences between both scores (t= -11.4 and p = 0.000).

Analysis of differences by gender

The responses to the items that reflect the perceptions and beliefs of students towards refugees in the European Union, that include the items from the Inclusive European Citizenry scale and the formulation of other related items, also usually show scores close to 3, and excepting in the second item in which the difference is significant and the Rosenthal r is very small, the rest of the responses from both men and women are similar.

Table 4. Differences in gender in the Inclusive Citizenry scale and other questions.

	Men		Women					
	M	DS	M	DS	U	Z	p	r
I consider refugee persons in the EU as citizens with full rights	3.91	1.09	4.01	1.04	33757.5	-.938	.348	
The arrival of refugees since 2015 is a test for the EU to prove that it defends Human Rights	3.41	1.28	3.14	1.26	30569.5	-2.390	.017	-.09
European democracy has been negatively affected by the arrival of refugee persons in its territory	2.66	1.27	2.56	1.10	33956	-.652	.514	
The valuation towards cultural and ethnic diversity in the European citizenry has decreased with the arrival of refugee persons	3	1.16	2.85	1.17	32912.5	-1.205	.228	
The arrival of refugee persons in the EU could be an opportunity to educate on peaceful coexistence	3.87	1.01	3.88	1.1	333305	-.62	.536	
The refugee crisis is more of a political problema than a humanitarian one	3.46	1.26	3.55	1.16	34287	-.554	.538	
The refugee crisis could break the EU	2.29	1.1	2.40	1.14	32769.5	-1.05	.293	
The refugee crisis could deteriorate the consensus of the democractic values that sustains the EU	2.88	1.14	2.80	1.13	33611.5	-.637	.524	
The arrival of refugees to the EU has increasingly provoked rejection from the European citizenry towards these people	3.37	1.13	3.29	1.17	33980.5	-.678	.498	
The arrival of refugees to the EU has reflected the lack of consensus between the leaders of the nations	3.75	1.03	3.60	.99	32062	-1.893	.058	
The refugee crisis in the EU is only a humanitarian problem	1.93	.96	2.08	1.05	32500	-1.426	.154	
The EU´s performance concerning the refugees does not protect the social integration of these people	3.60	1.07	3.55	1.06	33795	-.66	.51	
The EU has performed appropriately to avoid the massive entrance of refugees because terrorists are found within the groups	2.5	1.24	2.63	1.13	32782.5	-1.224	.221	
Because of the economic crisis there is not sufficient space in the EU to receive refugees	2.72	1.36	2.85	1.25	33181	-1.168	.243	

Discussion

The study presents the results of analysis of the attitudes towards refugees, considering the perception of the supposed threat and the generated affected reactions, and the perception of the performance by the European Union and the cession of equal rights, which allows assessment of the degree of inclusive European citizenship. Likewise, it enters into the relation established between the attitudes towards refugees and the structure of European citizenry open to the arrival of forced migrants under the statute of citizens of full rights. For which the threat, rights, and affected reactions scales have been adapted and validated, and the inclusive European citizenry scale has been created.

The first of the findings about the attitudes towards registered refugees is a notable widespread indifference and a low implication toward the refugee question on behalf of the future teachers that is valued in the tendency of central scores on the threats and rights scale (close the 3) and a low deviation from the middle values. The comparative of the middles in the inclusive European citizenry scale, of whom are found above and below the 50th percentile, show a scarce distance in the values, newly showing a pattern of very similar answers centered in all of the participants. In the same way, the affected reactions scale is lightly found below 5, demonstrating a neutral emotional tendency. The disinterest and disinformation toward refugees among the youth is a phenomenon that has also been recorded in Portugal (Padilla & Golberg, 2017). And coinciding with the inquiries carried out by the CIS in Europe with the Eurobarometer in which only 7% of the Spanish population considered the question of migrations a social and political priority while the European mean was 22% (Eurobarómetro, 2018). This lack of preoccupation has been tried to be explained by two different reasons: on one side, in terms of dimension of the situation, a reception of refugees much lower than that received by other Central European countries and a lack of experience in the management of refugees

is underlined. The expectations regarding the reception has not been covered, which generates avoiding a perception of migratory pressure. Another explanatory mechanism of a more ideological and mass-media nature, is the absence (until now) of an organized media discourse and strong xenophobic parties that could explain the economic crisis and the associated precariousness blaming migrants and promoting a discourse about the competition by the recourses. Other cultural and religious factors, more intense, are the existence of a catholic sector and a pro-immigration ¨cosmopolitan¨ left much wider than in other countries (Dixon et al., 2018), the persistence of certain Christian values, non-explicit, that translate into more active forms of solidarity and humanitarian support, strengthen the empathy of the certain sectors. Which adds a recent history of Spanish emigration present in the collective unconscious and defines the Spanish identity.

In contrast, the studies that have been carried out in other countries in Europe show a feeling of elevated threat, attitudes less positive towards refugees, with important differences according to the country of origin, and a discourse about the impossibility of receiving more people in their countries (Dixon et al, 2018; Plener et al. 2017). In Turkey, the youth and future teachers show visions much less concealed and empathetic with forced migrations, with high levels of rejection (Tarman & Gürel, 2017; Yitmen & Verkuyen, 2018). According to the contrasting studies, as the size of the refugee population increases, there is a worsening in attitudes, contravening the hypothesis of the contact.

Another of the relevant aspects of the investigation is the identification of an inclusive Europeanist feeling among the teachers. This returns to coincide with the Eurobarometer analysis from 2018 in which it was analyzed that 88% of the Spanish population is considered Europeanist, well above most member States. In this case, not only is the recognition with the European institutions and politics materialized, but also a position favorable to the arrival of

immigrants and a concession of equal citizen rights exists. Among the best rated attitudinal items, an opportunity to construct a more collective and inclusive is found, and perceiving in its arrival an opportunity to educate in coexistence. As it happened with the perception of threat, rights and affected reactions, this willingness to create a friendlier Europe is not shared in all European territories. We observe in our students more inclusive Europeanism than in other countries. This democratic vision of the European Union among young Spaniards finds its roots in different foundational myths. One is the consolidation of a democratic Spain with its entrance into the EU in 1986. Another is the implementation of educational programs for identity reinforcement and European participation as supranational educational programs, like Erasmus (Cadvieco & Pascual, 2013).

The gender differences in the citizenship scale demonstrate a more favorable attitude by women in attitudes like in inclusive citizenship. This gender difference coincides with almost all similar studies that have been done. Gender roles, the role that the woman assumes in reproduction and upbringing and the experience of inequality all have a significant role in the creation of sensibility and empathy toward others.

The fourth strong idea that is derived from this study is the existence of a relationship between attitudes toward refugees, and inclusive citizenship. The less negative cognitive attitude and emotions toward refugees, the more they defend their reception and assignment of rights. Perceived threat is the factor that most predicts inclusive European citizenship, followed by positively-affected reactions. This aspect highlights the effectiveness of the use of social threat theories to explain prejudice toward immigrants (De Oliveira et al., 2005). Paradoxically, the favorable attitude toward public and social rights for refugees (predisposition to access to health and education) does not have a predictive character on inclusive European citizenship. This can explain the existence of a

naturalization of social rights that is already offered to immigrants in Spain.

However, it cannot be ignored that in Spain, studies continue to analyze structural racism that can affect the true integration of refugees. Just like Pareja and López establish (2018), the appropriate perception and assessment of reception, or the absence of discrimination in the abstract is not necessarily associated with adequate integration. They stress that, although future teachers give the same value to all cultures, their positions differ when it comes to clarifying the weight that the majority culture should play in policy to be followed, or the situation of social inequality that members of different cultures than the native culture experience. Thus, an egalitarian assessment does not necessarily imply an egalitarian and functional participation on the organization of social life.

Implications for Intercultural and Inclusive Education with Refugees for Faculty

The permanence of an inclusive and relatively strong European identity and the existence of less negative attitudes toward immigration than in other European countries are not sufficient for an effective integration of refugee students and their families in schools. It is necessary to develop specific programs aimed at fostering integration in the classroom, improving teachers´ attitudes, ways of being and relating to diversity that coexists, managing non-discriminatory and democratizing practices in schools and to adapting curricula cross culturally (Banks, Suárez-Orozco & Ben-Peretz, 2016).

Based on the results obtained in this study, a series of recommendations for future intercultural educational training programs can be outlined, directed toward specifically working with refugees. These recommendations can be implemented by universities themselves, understood as democratic public spheres (Giroux, 2016).

In the first place, a formative educational program in in the context of refugees should know the realities of immigration, the reasons

for seeking refuge and asylum of those who are forced to immigrate, and the colonial histories of the countries that welcome them. Understanding the co-responsibility of European countries in contexts of many wars is necessary to generate a commitment by the faculty to give attention to and welcome the refugee students, and in this way, decrease the ignorance and identified indifference. At the same time, understanding the particularities of immigration will permit the teachers in training to approach situations that present themselves in a precise and careful manner according to the students' native countries and cultures.

Secondly, and in response to the role social threat demonstrates in the construction and prediction of an inclusive citizenship, the perception of danger and questioning students' status as a citizen and student have to be minimized in future teachers. One of the resources to work against threat, taking into account its relationship with theories of social identity, can be to deconstruct strong and excluding national identities (simple identities) and move toward healthier models of identity, that transcend the nation state, have multiple affiliations, and are transcultural, flexible and inclusive (complex identities) (Soriano, 2011). The work on the cultural identity of teachers can be linked to the exercise of personal and collective migratory histories, a work where historical memory allows the construction of mixed identities, more empathetic toward immigration as a universal human phenomenon. This will favor responding to one of the challenges that Banks *et al.* (2016) proposes of the need to integrate and cohere without assimilating. Another strategy to dissolve the perception of real and symbolic threat involves the work of prejudice and rumors, being the fundamental predicting factor of a welcoming European attitude. Racism can be dismantled by reviewing the privileges that generate social and racial order in non-racialized people.

The importance of the affected reactions makes it possible to develop emotional programs that can also have a positive effect in the level of acceptance of refugees, as well as European immigration policies. The emotional dimension toward "others" who are different from me, is usually exercised through empathy, that is to say putting oneself in another´s shoes in order to reconfigure generated reactions. The work of empathy as a way of emotional modification requires that spaces of individual and interpersonal emotional communication were previously generated, so that the future faculty can experience development.

Finally, with a more strategic sense, training should generate climates in which (origin, cultural, racial, gender, religious, and sexual orientation) diversity is primed, one can visualize how inequality is expressed and forms of liberal multiculturalism are questioned, being able to resort to terms of superdiversity and conviviality (Castaño *et al.*, 2011). To approach the racial colonial facets of liberal societies is fundamental in order to generate fairer educational practices.

Conclusion

The developed study makes a contribution to the scope of global immigration and intercultural citizenship from the socioeducational terrain in the southeast of Spain. Some of these reasons and strengths are recognized to initiate formative programs in intercultural and transcultural education, with the faculty taking advantage of the question of refugees in a globalized world.

The attitudes and the intercultural and inclusive European citizenship construction are particularly sensitive to socio-political changes, and may undergo rapid changes over time. It is therefore essential to make progress in teacher training proposals and curricular changes that avoid exclusionary attitudes in our schools.

References

ACNUR (2016). *Missing Out: Refugee Education in Crisis*. Recuperado de: http://www.unhcr.org/missingout

Allport, G. (1954). *The nature of prejudice*. Reading, MA: Perseus Book Publishing.

Banks, J. A., Suárez-Orozco, M., & Ben-Peretz, M. (Eds.). (2016). *Global migration, diversity, and civic education: Improving policy and practice*. Teachers College Press.

Cadavieco, J. F., & Pascual, Á. (2013). Estudio de las acciones Erasmus en Educación Superior. *Magister*, *25*(1), 74-82. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/S0212-6796(13)70010-0

Castaño, F. J. G., Alcaraz, A. O., Gómez, M. R., & Contini, P. (2011). Sobre multiculturalismos, críticas y superaciones conceptuales en la gestión de la diversidad cultural. In *Inmigración, ciudadanía y gestión de la diversidad* (pp. 31-65). Universidad Internacional de Andalucía.

De Lucas, J. (2001). Hacia una ciudadanía europea inclusiva. Su extensión a los inmigrantes. *Revista CIDOB d'Afers Internacionals*, 63-75.

De Oliveira, D. R., Techio, E. M., Páez, D., & Herranz, K. (2005). Factores predictores de las actitudes ante la inmigración. *Revista de psicología social*, *20*(1), 19-37. doi: https://doi.org/10.1174/0213474052871060

Dixon, T., Hawkins, S., Heijbroek, L., Juan-Torres, M., & Demoures, F. (2018). *Attitudes towards ational Identity, Immigration and Refugees in Italy*. London: More in Common Ltd.

Dryden-Peterson, S. (2016). Refugee education in countries of first asylum: Breaking open the black box of pre-resettlement experiences. *Theory and Research in Education*, *14*(2), 131-148. doi: https://doi.org/10.1177/1477878515622703

García, M.C., Navas, M.S., Cuadrado, I. & Molero, F. (2003). Inmigración y prejuicio: Actitudes de una muestra de adolescentes almerienses. *Acción Psicológica*, *2*(2), 137-147.

Giroux, H.A. (2016). La educación superior y las políticas de ruptura. *Revista Entramados-Educación y Sociedad*, *3*(3), 15 - 26.

Gualda, E. (2011). *Inmigración, ciudadanía y gestión de la diversidad*. Universidad Internacional de Andalucía.

Li, G. (2018). Divergent paths, same destiny: A Bourdieusian perspective on refugee families' negotiation of urban school transition in the US. *European Journal of Education*. 0 (0). doi: https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12300

Liza G. Steele & Lamis Abdelaaty (2018): Ethnic diversity and attitudes towards refugees, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2018.1513785

McWilliams, J. A., & Bonet, S. W. (2016). Continuums of precarity: Refugee youth transitions in American high schools. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 35, 153–170. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/02601370.2016.1164468

Murray, K. E., & Marx, D. M. (2013). Attitudes toward unauthorized immigrants, authorized immigrants, and refugees. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, *19*(3), 332. doi: https://doi.org/10.1037/a0030812

Padilla, B., & Goldberg, A. (2017). Real and symbolic dimensions of the" refugee crisis" in Europe: a critical analysis from Portugal. *REMHU: Revista Interdisciplinar da Mobilidade Humana*, *25*(51), 11-27.

Pareja, E. F. H., & López, M. (2018). Interculturality and teacher education: A study from pre-service teachers' perspective. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*. *43*(3), 74. doi: https://doi.org/10.14221/ajte.2018v43n3.5

Pettigrew, T. F. (1979). The ultimate attribution error: Extending Allport's cognitive analysis of prejudice. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 5*, 461-476.

Pettigrew, T.F. (1998). Intergroup contact theory. *Annual Review of Psychology. 49*(1), 65-85. doi: https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.49.1.65

Plener, P. L., Groschwitz, R. C., Brähler, E., Sukale, T., & Fegert, J. M. (2017). Unaccompanied refugee minors in Germany: attitudes of the general population towards a vulnerable group. *European child & adolescent psychiatry*, *26*(6), 733-742. doi: https://doi.org/10.1007/s00787-017-0943-9

Schweitzer, R., Perkoulidis, S.A., Krome, S. L.& Ludlow, C. N. (2005) Attitudes towards Refugees: The Dark Side of Prejudice in Australia. *Australian Journal of Psychology, 57*(3), 170-179. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/00049530500125199

Sharkey, J. (2018). The promising potential role of intercultural citizenship in preparing mainstream teachers for im/migrant populations. *Language Teaching Research, 22*(5), 570-589. doi: https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168817718577

Sidanius J. & Pratto, F (1999). *Social Dominance: An intergroup theory of social hierarchy and oppression.* New York: Cambridge University Press. doi: https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781139175043

Soriano, E. (2011). Diagnóstico de la identidad cultural en escuelas multiculturales e intervención educativa. In E. Soriano (Coord) *La interculturalidad como factor de calidad educativa* (pp.175-208). Madrid: La Muralla.

Stark, T. H., Mäs, M., & Flache, A. (2015). Liking and disliking minority-group classmates: Explaining the mixed findings for the influence of ethnic classroom composition on interethnic attitudes. *Social science research*, *50*, 164-176.

Stephan, W. G., & Stephan, C. (1993). Cognition and affect in stereotyping: Parallel interactive networks. In D. M. Mackie, & D. L. Hamilton (Eds.), *Affect, cognition and stereotyping: Interactive*

processes in group perception (pp. 111 – 136). Orlando, FL: Academic Press. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-088579-7.50010-7

Stephan, W. & Stephan, C. (2000) An integrated threat theory of prejudice. In S. Oskamp (ed.) *Reducing prejudice and discrimination*. New Jersey: Laurence Erlbaum.

Stephan, W. G., Ybarra, O., & Bachman, G. (1999). Prejudice Toward Immigrants. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, *29*(11), 2221-2237. doi: https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1559-1816.1999.tb00107.x

Tajfel, H & Turner, J. (1979). An integrative theory of intergroup conflict. In S. Worchel & W. G. Austin (Eds). *Psychology of intergroup relations* (pp. 33-47). Chicago: Nelson-Hall Publishers.

Tarman, B., & Gürel, D. (2017). Awareness of social studies teacher candidates on refugees in Turkey. *The Journal of Social Studies Research*, *41*(3), 183-193. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2016.11.001

Wrench, A., Soong, H., Paige, K., & Garrett, R. (2018). Building spaces of hope with refugee and migrant-background students. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, *22*(11), 1197-1212. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2017.1420251

Yitmen, Ş., & Verkuyten, M. (2018). Positive and negative behavioural intentions towards refugees in Turkey: The roles of national identification, threat, and humanitarian concern. *Journal of Community & Applied Social Psychology*. doi: https://doi.org/10.1002/casp.2354

Authors / Autores	To know more / Saber más
Verónica C. Cala (vcc284@ual.es) Bachelor of Medicine, PhD in Education for Transcultural Health. She is the contact author for this article. Member of the research group "Research and evaluation in intercultural education" (HUM665) and member of the Center for the Study of Migrations and Intercultural Relations (CEMyRI) of the University of Almeria (Spain). Her postal address is: Central Building, Floor 2, Office 11. 04120 - La Cañada de San Urbano, Almeria (Spain)	ORCID 0000-0003-1254-1667 Google académico Dialnet
Encarna Soriano-Ayala (esoriano@ual.es) Full Professor in the area of Research Methods and Diagnosis in Education. Director of the research group "Research and evaluation in intercultural education (HUM665) and member of the Center for the Study of Migrations and Intercultural Relations (CEMyRI) of the University of Almeria (Spain). Her postal address is: Central Building, Floor 2, Office 12. 04120 - La Cañada de San Urbano, Almeria (Spain).	ORCID 0000-0002-9506-0625 Dialnet
Manuel J. López-Martínez (mlm138@ual.es) Professor of the Department of Education, area of knowledge of Didactics of the Social Sciences. He is a member of the research group "Research and evaluation in intercultural education (HUM665) His postal address is: Departmental Building of Humanities and Education Sciences I (Building A), Floor 2, Office 36. 04120 - La Cañada de San Urbano, Almería (Spain).	ORCID 0000-0001-6653-1398 Dialnet

RELIEVE

Revista **EL**ectrónica de **I**nvestigación y **EV**aluación **E**ducativa
E-Journal of Educational Research, Assessment and Evaluation